

## On *mantra* in The Battle for Sanskrit

*Sati Shankar*

Global Synergetic Foundation  
New Delhi, India

Recently on *Bharatiya Vidvat Parishat*, a Google Group, Shri Shatavadhani Ganesh made some comments on The Battle of Sanskrit by Mr. Rajiv Malhotra.

[https://groups.google.com/forum/?utm\\_source=digest&utm\\_medium=email#!topic/bvparishat/e4i\\_jHilp98](https://groups.google.com/forum/?utm_source=digest&utm_medium=email#!topic/bvparishat/e4i_jHilp98)

Topic:- [The following quotation of Sri Shatavadhani Ganesh]

Appendix B. Untenable Arguments

[Sri Rajiv Malhotra says----]

**“Meditation mantras...produce effects which ordinary sounds do not.” (p. 21; also see pp. 32, 11)**

Sri Satavadhani Ganesh's comments on this as follows---

[1] "This is at best a **theological argument** of a *mimAmsaka*."

Worth noting is the use of the term "Theological" in the context of *mimAnsa*. We have become so accustomed to Christian vocabulary that we start it using even while discussing the Bharatiya Tradition, which is in itself so holistic, that a possibility of risk of misinterpretation can not be denied even in using the word "integral" for it and seeking grounds on which on one facet of *samyaka* in our holistic tradition is alleged to laugh on the other. Here *deva* or *devi* of *mimansa* are not exactly the "God" of theology so conceptual superimposition is mistaken. "Theology translates into English from the Greek *theologia* which derived from *Theos*, meaning "God," and *-logia*, meaning "utterances, sayings, or oracles" (a word related to *logos*, meaning "word, discourse, account, or reasoning") which had passed into Latin as *theologia* and into French as *théologie*. The English equivalent "theology" (Theologie, Theologie) had evolved by 1362 CE. The sense the word has in English depends in large part on the sense the Latin and Greek equivalents had acquired in Patristic and medieval Christian usage, though the English term has now spread beyond Christian contexts." Richard Hooker defined "theology" in English as "the science of **"things"** divine"., for further see <https://en.wiktionary.org/wiki/theology> and <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Theology>

Let us consider our own tradition;

In our Sanatan tradition, we consider "*devatA*", "*devi*", or whatever we perceive the form and name it, *nAma - rUpa*, is realised in our tradition as *vishvam ekam*, (RV. 3.54.8), the many are the One and the One that is manifold, *vishvam satyam*, (RV. 2.24.12); the manifold truth, and *vishvam .....garbham* (RV. 10.121.7). therefore, if asked, "Is He One or many?", our tradition says, "One and many", The general principle is, the *devah* is every where of one and the same form. (RV.8.11.8)., that is, "Even as he seems, so is he named" RV. 5.44.6., the way being *anurUpah*, *pratirUpah*, (JBU.1.27). Here, He, Prajapati, *manifests in "Himself"*, so this universe, *idam sarvam*, perceived according to *anurUpam*, *pratirUpam*, to be declared "One and many", there by clarifying that the translation of the *NasadIya Sukta*, the Manifestation Hymn, as the "Creation Hymn", signifies the error interpretation and naming by the Indologists had in their minds the "Creationist presuppositions" of Christianity. Therefore, using the "God" for the "Self Manifested", *idam sarvam*, is like limiting Him and equally makes "theology" a term unfit to proceed for *brahma jijnAsA* of our tradition. *PrajApti*, thus manifested in Himself, *idam sarvam*, selforganizes in *dharma* by his own multifarious *sva-bhAva*, such that in Him are all beings, *idam sarvam*, *manas*, *prAnah*, *nAma-rUpa*, are within, as coincident; "sent by Him onto him, and born of Him into him, it is in Him that all this universe is stabilised, that is how our tradition invokes for *shAnti*, ... *sarve devAh shAntih*, *nakshatrsh shAntih*, *vanaspatayah shantih*.....*aum shAntih*, *shAntih*, *shAntih*... to keep the equilibrium in *idam sarvam* intact, for welfare of the cosmos. Our scriptures teach, "*idam sarvam brahm*" and therefore, being a manifestation within, *Aham brahmAsmi* since we *aikik* and *samyaka* are this "*idam sarvam*", well connected in such a way that a chance deviation at any level, be it microcosm or macrocosm, does not leave unaffected within. These are just examples within the limits of this forum. Note *Ayurveda* follows the same when it takes up *nidAna*, which we will see below.

So a sweeping authoritative generalization like "This is at best a **theological argument** of a *mimAmsaka*." is clearly a mistake as we commit most often, especially when we approach our texts through translations by Western authors

or by Indians who have /had their Gurus in them. I hope with these highly compressed lines I have brought the reader to a place from where we can venture in to the second part of the issue, where we can examine if the *mantra* has any bearing upon us, or really got laughed at itself and discarded in Ayurveda. *manas* (=Prajapati) and the chariot, contained in *idam sarvam*, in simple words, our *sthU* body has to have *manas* to be in *svabhAva*. Further, manifestation in self appears with *vAk* co-existing with *dhvani*. Below we will have an opportunity to see how this *dhvani* affects us and modern science and technologies are striving hard to catch the core. But before that we need the ground to see "whom" and with what *svabhAva* the Ayurveda aims to treat only then we will be able to know if *vAk*, *dhvani*, *shabd*, have any capability to make impact. For music (= *vAk*, *dhvani*, *shabda* (semantics) we are taught that,

‘Swaranti Twa Sute Naro Vaso Nireka Uktinaj’ (RV 8.33.2).

‘O! Disciple, you have come to me with the sacred desire of the enlightening the inner self.

Let me tell you the ways of reaching thy-light.

If you call thou through your sentiments accompanied by pure music,

thy shall illuminate your inner heart with divine love’.

Having established the significance of sound energy, let us take up the other issue raised...

The second comment by Sri Shatavadhani Ganesh was:

[2] "If mantras truly had healing effects, why did our tradition evolve from the *daiva-vyapasraya* of the *Atharva Veda* (which believed that certain chants and spells could cure a disease) into the *yukti-vyapasraya* of *Ayurveda* (which relies completely on observation; it doesn't speak about even the healing effects of *yogAsanas*, let alone mantra)? In fact, Vagbhata laughs at people who seek proof for medicines in mantras."

Ayurveda is a complete way of life, and this system improves not only a person's health, but also their well being, behavior and state of mind. My purpose here solely is to connect the real semantics so that any union or disjunction or nullity of intersection can be characterized clearly. While explaining *Ayurveda*, characterises clearly the "Ayu" in *Ayurveda*.

*SharIrendriyatsvAtmsanyogo,dhAri jIvitam*  
*nitygschanubandhsch paryairAyuruchchye.*

(Charak SamhitA, *sutrasthAnam*,42) says clearly that our body(*sthUla sharIra*) is made up of five elements, being the seat of *AtmA*, comprising *bhautika indriya* (organs)*manas* (satva),*chetna* seer, enjoyer, *jIva*, and *Ishvara*, all combined together is *Ayuh*.

Moreover, *tatrAyuschetnAnuvrittihjIvitmanubandho dhArichetyekorthah*, (it is Susrut)

Further,

*sarvadA sarvabhAvAnAm sAmAnyam vridhikAraNam*

*hrAseturviSeshasch pravrittirubhayastu tu.* (Charak SamhitA, *sutrasthAnam*,44)

In all the conditions, only the state of equilibrium, *sAmAnyam sthiti*, is the true state of *dharma* (of *idam sarvam* ~ both micro and macrocosm...) any deviation warrants attention, *nidAna*.

Let us come to the second issue of this thread where mantra are said to be laughed at by the *Ayurvedika yukti*.

Mantras are Vedic in origin. It is considered that it is capable of transformation. Their use and type varies according to the school and philosophy associated with the mantra. Mantra is intrinsically related to sound and sound is reverberating in everything in this universe. "Mantra Meditation" from

[http://www.meditationiseasy.com/mCorner/techniques/Mantra\\_meditation.htm](http://www.meditationiseasy.com/mCorner/techniques/Mantra_meditation.htm). A Mantra is a sound repeated over and over until it integrates into our consciousness - frees the mind from its constant doing, and elevates us to an altered state of awareness. The Sanskrit word mantra combines the root *man* (to think) with the suffix *tra* instrument or tool). Therefore, mantra means literally tool for thinking. <http://www.tricycle.com/onpractice/mantra-tool->

[thinking \[Accessed on: 25/05/2012\]](#). The relation between speech and sound with the psychic state and happiness, cannot be denied.

If we suppose, rather bluntly (which I do not support), that mantra were meaningless syllables assigned certain phonetic attributes meant for rituals, if I am allowed to use the language of eighteenth century translators in the West, and if suppose that I am saying all this to one who has special faculty, no intent to go *AdhyAtmika* to transcend the phenomenal, we cannot deny that in our daily life music (of one's choice) carries one away from his or her then state to a state of relaxation if not peace of mind. This establishes clearly the impact of sound energy, suitable pitches, on our psychological and mental states, which are part of the Ayu, as defined above, so a subject matter of Ayurveda. This signifies a dimension where one can not deny the impact of sound on a living being. Sound and music has been very much a tool to cure not only our mind and body but also to transcend this phenomenal.

Our scripture says, 'Swaranti Tva Sute Naro Vaso Nireka Uktina;' (RV 8.33.2).

*'O! Disciple, you have come to me with the sacred desire of the enlightening the inner self. Let me tell you the ways of reaching thy-light. If you call thou through your sentiments accompanied by pure music, thy shall illuminate your inner heart with divine love'.*

Now in such a *samyak*, integrated state where equilibrium is the ideal state, antecedent and consequent are bound to be a complex network and if we resort to the condition, what we call, *ceteris paribus*, cannot be considered to be a justified. That is why treatment in *Ayurveda* is not mere curing of *sthUla SarIra*, but it includes *mana*, *vyavhAra*, in short, it includes correction of psychological and behavioural aspects also.

Some of our esteemed members have already noted in other threads of their group Vagbhata (*Ashtanga Hridaya*, Chikitsa-*sthana*, 1-177), which recommends the use of Mantras to heal diseases.

औषधयो मणयश्च सुमन्त्राः  
साधुगुरुद्विजदैवतपूजाः ।  
प्रीतिकरा मनसो विषयाश्च  
ग्रन्थपि विष्णुकृतं उवरमुग्रम् ॥ १७७ ॥  
इति श्रीवैद्यपतिसिंहशुतसुतुश्रीमद्भागवतविरचिता-  
यामष्टाङ्गहृदयसंहितायां चतुर्थे चिकित्सितस्थाने  
उवरचिकित्सितं नाम प्रथमोऽध्यायः ॥ १ ॥

सू०-औषधादयो विष्णुकृतमप्युग्र उवर प्रसिद्धः । किं पुन-  
रप्यचार्यद्विकृत उवर न प्रसिद्धः इत्यपि शब्दाः । औ तु भगवति  
दोषकमेतत् ।

इति श्रीसुगाङ्गदत्तपुत्रश्रीमदरुणदत्तविरचितायामष्टाङ्गहृदयटी-  
काया सप्तोऽध्यायः । चतुर्थे चिकित्सितस्थाने उव-  
रचिकित्सितं नाम प्रथमोऽध्यायः समाप्तः ॥ १ ॥

आ० १०-सिद्धौषधादिपारणमाह-औषधय इति । स-  
ङ्गहे तु ( चि. अ. २ )-“कैला त्रिकर्णलघुका रुद्रपिप्रादि  
विनोदिनी । सौख्य विविध शृणुयास्त मेतव्याधिताश्रयम् ॥  
मनोभिरामविषय वचन ह्लादि दक्षिणम् । मातर पितर  
देवान् वैद्यान् विमान् हर हरिम् ॥ पूजयेच्छीलये हानदम-  
सत्यद्वयार्जवान् । धारयेच्च ह्युचिर्दृष्टौ मणिरत्नमहौषधी ॥  
आर्योवलोकितं पर्णशबरीमपराजिताम् । म्रगमेदार्धतारा  
च सर्वैश्वरनिबृलये । जैपलथा गतोष्णीष सर्वव्याधिविधि-  
स्त्रितम् । आगन्तुदोषसहजै सर्वैरोगैर्विमुच्यते ॥” इति ॥

इति हेमाद्रिटीकायामाष्टौर्धेदुरसायने ।  
उवरप्रकरणं नाम सामन्त्येव निरूपितम् ॥ १ ॥

१ 'चिकित्सितम्' क. । २ 'औष' अ इ क. । ३ 'कालि-  
वर्ष' दिनी । अल्ला विविधा शृणु० अथा ॥ मनोभिरामा विषया  
वचन' स इ इ । ४ 'त चार्थो शब्' स मू. । ५ 'जप तथागतो'  
सं. मू. । 'जपेत्तथागतो श्रीप सर्वे उवरचि' क. । 'जपेत्तथा' इ. ।

Therefore, even if we confine to our ancient texts dis-junction or rather rejection of Mantra cannot be justified as

claimed by the commentator above. Situation becomes more interesting when we look at our current scientific activities to explore relation, and hence impact of sound energies, both, overt and covert, on our psyche and well being, what our *Ayurveda*, being an integral part of our "*Veda*" aims at. Although *mantra*, *mani* and *aushadhi* being the basic forms of treatment in *Ayurveda*, Mantra treatment is given first preference as it is believed that it is *Daivi* (divine) form of treatment. <http://sandu.in/akasha.html> . Following a survey article, MANTRA (INCANTATIONS) - DIVINE REMEDIAL IN AYURVEDA by Aparna Pravin Deshpande\*, *Ayurpharm Int J Ayur Alli Sci.*, Vol.3, No.3 (2014) Pages 61 - 72 we can find numerous references emphasizing Mantra recitation in *Ayurveda* texts especially in *Caraka Samhita*.

- (1) In *Jaatakarma* that is the reciting of mantras in the newborn's right ear, requesting the Gods to protect the newborn from evil spirits. (*Caraka samhita*, Part-1 (Carakacandrika Hindi commentary). Brahmananda Tripathi, Ganga sahay Pandey, editors. 1st ed. Varanasi: Chaukhambha Surbharati Prakashana; 2009. Sharirasthana, 8/46.p.967.)
- (2) In the treatment of Jwara (fever), Charaka recommends chanting *Vishnu Sahasra nama* ( *Caraka samhita*, Part-2 (Ayushi Hindi commentary). Harishchandrasinha Kushavaha, editor. 1st ed. Varanasi: Chaukhambha Orientaliya; 2009. Chikitsasthana, 3/312,313. p.134.)
- (3) In the treatment of poisoning (*Caraka samhita*, Part-2 (Ayushi Hindi commentary). Harishchandrasinha Kushavaha, editor. 1st ed. Varanasi: Chaukhambha Orientaliya; 2009. Chikitsasthana, 23/61.p.589 )
- (4) In Unmada (Insanity) and Apasmara (Epilepsy) (*Caraka samhita*, Part-2 (Ayushi Hindi commentary). Harishchandrasinha Kushavaha, editor. 1st ed. Varanasi: Chaukhambha Orientaliya; 2009. Chikitsasthana, 9/89. p.262. )
- (5) In treatment of aagantuja shopha (exogenous oedema) (*Caraka samhita*, Part-2 (Ayushi Hindi commentary). Harishchandra sinha Kushavaha, editor. 1st ed. Varanasi:Chaukhambha Orientaliya; 2009. Chikitsasthana, 10/53.p.271.)
- (6) In Vishachikitsa (Treatment of Poisoning) (*Sushruta Samhita*, Vol. 3. Sharma PV, editor. 1st ed. Varanasi: Chaukhambha Visvabharati Prakashana; 2001. Kalpasthana, 5/10. p.47.)
- (7) During the labour (Prasuti) (*Caraka samhita*, Part-1, (Carakacandrika Hindi commentary). Brahmananda Tripathi, Ganga sahay Pandey, editors. 1st ed. Varanasi: Chaukhambha Surbharati Prakashana; 2009. Sutrasthana, 18/5. p.366.30. )
- (8) Before collection of herbal drugs (*Caraka samhita*, Part-1, (Carakacandrika Hindi commentary). Brahmananda Tripathi, Ganga sahay Pandey, editors. 1st ed. Varanasi: Chaukhambha Surbharati Prakashana; 2009. Sharirasthana, 8/39. p.961.)
- (9) Before the procedure like *jatakarma*  
[http://www.hindupedia.com/en/The\\_Significance\\_of\\_Mantra\\_in\\_Ayurveda](http://www.hindupedia.com/en/The_Significance_of_Mantra_in_Ayurveda)
- (10) In the treatment of snake bites, antidotes are prepared while chanting specific mantras to increase the efficacy of the medicine [http://www.hindupedia.com/en/The\\_Significance\\_of\\_Mantra\\_in\\_Ayurveda](http://www.hindupedia.com/en/The_Significance_of_Mantra_in_Ayurveda)
- (11) *Aapo hi stha* mentioned in *Sadvritta* (Code of conduct)of *Ayurveda* is originally from Rig-Veda  
[http://www.hindupedia.com/en/The\\_Significance\\_of\\_Mantra\\_in\\_Ayurveda](http://www.hindupedia.com/en/The_Significance_of_Mantra_in_Ayurveda)

In this way the role of mantra is better described and well defined in many places. Other than this, it is described (12) in *Vamana* (Emesis) and *Virecana* (Purgation) (*Caraka samhita*, Part-1 (Caraka candrika Hindi commentary). BrahmanandaTripathi, Ganga sahay Pandey, editors. 1st ed. Varanasi: ChaukhambhaSurbharatiPrakashana; 2009. Sutra sthana, 8/ 28.p.205.

Space bounds me to not to include use of mantra in Yogic practices, but id a disjunction is calimed between yoga and mantra, that will be as a mistake as was claimed in issue herein above between *AyurvedA* and *mantra*. Further can be explored through, for example, " *Towards Ayurvedic Biology - Indian Academy of Sciences; A decadal vision Document 2006*"; Indian Academy of Sciences, Bangalore. Retrieved from: <http://www.ias.ac.in/academy/dvdocs/ayurvis.pdf> [Accessed on:25/05/2013]

Hope this clears some suffocation and some illusion.

New Delhi  
April 2nd 2016